

## Diplomatic Priorities: Changes in the Tang Bestowal of Titles on Silla and Parhae

KIM JONGBOK

---

A typical model explaining pre-modern international relationships in East Asia is the tribute system in which Chinese emperors granted office titles to monarchs of surrounding states who in turn paid tribute to the Chinese throne. This model, which depends on the historical records of the state bestowing titles, cannot fully explain the international relationships centering on China for it fails to account for the internal conditions of the surrounding states. This study examines changes in the Tang bestowal of titles to determine the position and status of Silla and Parhae in the world order for which Tang hoped. The Tang bestowal of titles reflected its intended world order and its policy for implementing that order. The bestowed titles had to be changed if Tang intentions were not realized. Changes in Tang titles reflect Silla and Parhae responses to Tang policy; Tang upgraded titles when Silla and Parhae accepted Tang policies and downgraded them when they resisted.

**Keywords:** Silla, Parhae, Tang, bestowed titles, subordinated prefecture

East Asia underwent a period of turmoil in the seventh century. Koguryō 高句麗, which conquered the northern part of the Korean peninsula and the Manchurian region, was in conflict with Paekche 百濟 and Silla 新羅 on the southern end of the peninsula. Meanwhile, Sui 隋 and Tang 唐, which unified China, enforced the world order for which they hoped on their surrounding states, and in the process, they launched decades of attacks on Koguryō. Silla and Tang entered into an alliance. Silla wanted to defeat Paekche while Tang wanted to defeat Koguryō, so together they first defeated Paekche and then Koguryō. Silla and Tang, however, later fought each other over the reign in the former territory of Paekche and the war ended with Silla gaining the territory but apologizing to Tang. Silla claimed that it unified the three Kingdoms while Tang claimed that it realized the world order for which Tang hoped. In the former territory of Koguryō, however, the remnants of the Koguryō ruling class mustered the Malgal 靺鞨 (C. Mohe) tribes and founded Parhae 渤海 (C. Bohai).<sup>1</sup>

Korean historians call the Silla-Parhae period in the history of Korea “the Northern and Southern Kingdom Period” (南北國時代). The colonial historians of Imperial Japan incorporated Parhae into the history of Manchuria, while defiant Chinese historians claimed that Parhae was part of the Chinese Northeast history. Contemporary Chinese historians participating in the Northeast Project claim that not only Parhae but also Koguryō were local Chinese regimes.<sup>2</sup> As a proof of such claim, they cite the fact that Koguryō and Parhae offered tribute to Tang and that Tang granted offices in return.

Tribute and investiture are important characteristics of the historical international orders of East Asia. Fairbank conceptualized this pre-modern East Asian world order as the tributary system<sup>3</sup> while Nishijima conceived of it as the investiture system.<sup>4</sup> Both models have come under sustained criticism. For one thing, these theories are characterized by a Sinocentric logic that overlooked the positions and situations of the surrounding states. This is partly because Chinese records are ample and while the records of the surrounding states are scarce, thus engendering an excessive interpretive weight on Chinese sources and perspectives.<sup>5</sup> The reality, however, revolved around certain formal relationships that must not be ignored when explaining the status of

<sup>1</sup> In this article, the Romanization of Malgal, Parhae, and other proper nouns are expressed through Korean readings because the Liaodong and Manchuria regions are closer to Korean history than to Chinese history.

<sup>2</sup> Kim Chongbok, *Parhae chōngch'ŏ oegyo sa* (Sōul: Ilchusa), 2009, 229–327; Song Kiho, *The Clash of Histories in East Asia* (Seoul: Northeast Asian History Foundation, 2010), 179–370.

<sup>3</sup> John King Fairbank, ed. *The Chinese World Order* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press), 1968, 19.

<sup>4</sup> Nishijima Sadao, *Chūgoku kodai kokka to higasi Ajia sekai* (Tōkyō: Tōkyō Daigaku Shūppankai, 1983), 408.

<sup>5</sup> Many Korean scholars share this position in their criticism of tribute and investiture as characterized by the Chinese Northeast Project. See Yō Hogyu, et al. *Han'guk kodae kukka wa Chungguk wangjo ūi chogong ch'aepong kwan'gye* [A study of tributary relationships between ancient states of Korean and Chinese dynasties] (Sōul: Koguryō Yōn'gu Chaedan, 2008), 9–12.

international relationships. Considering these points, Kaneko has observed that the investiture system theory could be reinforced by closely examining the noble title (爵號) Tang bestowed on the monarchs of the surrounding states in the eighth century. In this interpretation, the title of Parhae Commandery Prince (渤海郡王)<sup>6</sup> that Tang bestowed on Tae Choyŏng 大祚榮 in 713 suggests that he was subordinate to Tang. Tang bestowed the title of the King of the Parhae State (渤海國王) on his grandchild in 762, meaning that his title was lower than that of a Silla King.<sup>7</sup>

The titles Tang bestowed on the kings of surrounding states, however, included not only the noble title but also the official title (職事官), the prestige title (散官), and an honorific rank (勳號). An examination of these titles, especially with an appreciation of their changing meanings over time, can provide a far richer understanding of the intricacies of the relationships between Tang and its neighbors. We thus intend to compare and examine the titles of the kings of Silla and Parhae that the Tang emperors bestowed from the eighth to the tenth centuries. These titles reflected the world order for which Tang hoped to make, but they were not fixed. If the promotion of bestowed titles points to the development of the relationship between those who bestow and those who receive, the demotion of bestowed titles points to the deterioration of the relationship. These changes reveal the dynamics of the positions of the surrounding states whose records did not survive to the present.

## 1. Tang Titles in Northeast Asia in the Early Eighth Century

### (1) Silla: From the Silla-Tang Alliance to the End of the Silla-Tang Campaign

Silla entered the East Asian diplomatic arena for the first time in 377 when it sent emissaries to Former Qin 前秦, but it was not until 565 that the Silla king first received foreign investiture, from Northern Qi 北齊, some two hundred years after Koguryŏ and Paekche first began the practice. Likewise, the Silla throne received investiture from the short-lived Sui in 594, ten years after Koguryŏ and Paekche did. Tang, however, simultaneously invested the kings of Koguryŏ, Paekche, and Silla in 624.<sup>8</sup> Tang bestowed the honorific rank Supreme Pillar of State (上柱國) upon the king of Koguryŏ<sup>9</sup> while

<sup>6</sup> Translations of Tang titles follow: Charles O. Hucker, *A Dictionary of Official Titles in Imperial China* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1985).

<sup>7</sup> Kaneko Shūichi, *Zui Tō no kokusai to higasi Ajia* (Tōkyō: Kankōkai, 2001), 277, 285–286.

<sup>8</sup> Liu Xu, comp., *Jiu tangshu* (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1975 [945]), 1–14.

<sup>9</sup> Kim Pusik, comp., *Yŏkchu sanguk sagi*, trans. by Chŏng Kubok, (Sŏngnam: Han'guk Chŏngsin Munhwa Yŏn'guwŏn, 1996 [1145]), 20: 204.

investing the king of Silla with the title Pillar of State (柱國),<sup>10</sup> one class lower level than the Supreme Pillar of State.

In 624, Tang granted King Chinp'yŏng of Silla (眞平王, r. 579-632) the titles Pillar of State, Duke of the Lelang Commandery (樂浪郡公), and King of Silla. These titles applied equally to his successor Queen Sŏndŏk (善德王, r. 632-647). In 648, however, Tang invested Queen Chindŏk (眞德王, r. 647-654) as Pillar of State, Lelang Commandery Prince (樂浪郡王), and King of Silla,<sup>11</sup> effectively upgraded her noble title from Duke to Prince.<sup>12</sup> In the winter of that year, Silla emissary Kim Ch'unch'u 金春秋 forged the Silla-Tang alliance with Emperor Taizong (太宗, r. 626-649) of Tang. Silla understood the agreement to mean that after the Silla-Tang allied armies defeated Paekche and Koguryŏ, Silla would take Paekche territory south of Taedong River. Therefore, Silla promptly implemented the pro-Tang policies of adopting Tang-style clothing and the Tang imperial era name. Tang later upgraded Queen Chindŏk to Lelang Commandery Prince. This was a friendly signal to Silla; after Tang attacked Koguryŏ in a solo campaign in 645 and failed. This defeat moved Tang to pay greater attention to the strategic importance of Silla, located as it was on the southern border of Koguryŏ.

In 654, Kim Ch'unch'u ascended the Silla throne as King T'aejong Muyŏl (太宗 武烈王, r. 654-661). The Tang court invested him as Commander of Unequaled Honor (開府儀同三司), Lelang Commandery Prince, and King of Silla<sup>13</sup>. Commander of Unequaled Honor was the highest level of civil prestige title, qualifying the recipient to establish a feudatory independently. This illustrates how the Tang gave special treatment to Silla in accordance with the Silla-Tang alliance. In addition to these titles, he presumably received the title Supreme Pillar of State because when his son, King Munmu (文武王, r. 661-681), was enthroned, he received the Tang titles Commander of Unequaled Honor, Supreme Pillar of State, Lelang Commandery Prince, and King of the Silla State.<sup>14</sup>

<sup>10</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 4: 57.

<sup>11</sup> Liu Xu, *Jiu tangshu*, 3: 62; Sima Guang, et al., *Zizhi tongjian* (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1957 [1084]), 198: 6252; Wang Qinruo et al., comp., *Cefu yuangui* (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1960 [1013]), 964: 11340. Emperor Taizong of Tang invested King Chindŏk in the second month 647. See Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 5:63. I have adopted the date of the records of the title-bestowing state.

<sup>12</sup> When King Chindŏk ascended the throne, the Tang Emperor sent her silk embroidered with "The Song of Great Peace to the Emperor of Tang," having newly installed her as the Kyerim State King (鷄林國王). This suggests the Tang court had upgraded her to Lelang Commandery Prince.

<sup>13</sup> Liu Xu, *Jiu tangshu*, 199: 5336; Wang Qinruo, *Cefu yuangui*, 964: 11340; Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 5: 67. The Civil Prestige title of Kim Ch'unch'u, who died in 661, was Lord Specially Advanced (特進, Rank 2A), so the title Commander Unequaled in Honor, granted to him upon enthronement, was presumably a posthumous title. The title Lord Specially Advanced was granted in 648 when he concluded the Silla-Tang alliance agreement. It would therefore be rational to conclude that after he ascended the throne he received a promotion from Lord Specially Advanced to Commander Unequaled in Honor. See Wang Qinruo, *Cefu yuangui*, 964: 11340; Sima Guang, *Zizhi tongjian*, 200: 6325.

<sup>14</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 6: 73.

In 663, Tang nominally established a subordinated prefecture (羈縻州), the Kyerim Superior Prefecture Command (鷄林大都督府) in Silla, and appointed King Munmu as the Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander (鷄林州大都督).<sup>15</sup> Prior to that, in 660, Tang allied with Silla to defeat Paekche, and applied the Tang local government system to the conquered territories but with the appointment of a Paekche person as the local government officer rather than a Tang official. This subordinated prefecture system, a form of indirect rule, was an innovation. It worked as a balance between territorialization and bestowal to the surrounding states which indicates direct ruling and indirect ruling policies, respectively.<sup>16</sup>

Tang established a subordinated prefecture in the territory of its ally Silla, thereby suggesting not only that Tang took the initiative in the Silla-Tang alliance, but also that its intention was also to rule over Silla over as Tang territory. Tang later divided the former Paekche territories equally between itself and Silla, creating the Ungjin Prefecture Command (熊津都督府) to rule over the western area and appointing the Paekche prince, Buyŏ Yung 扶餘隆, as Ungjin Prefecture Commander (熊津都督). In the eighth month of 665, he and King Munmu concluded an agreement not to invade each other's territory under Tang authority.<sup>17</sup> At the time, King Munmu was also the Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander, so Tang recognized Silla and Paekche not as the winner and the defeated, but as Kyerim Superior Prefecture Command and Ungjin Prefecture Command, both the subordinate prefectures equal to those incorporated into the Tang imperium.<sup>18</sup>

In the eleventh month of 667, Tang granted the general-in-chief banner to King Munmu for his support in the subjugation of Koguryŏ.<sup>19</sup> In the seventh month of 671, King Munmu sent a letter to Xue Rengui 薛仁貴 in which he identified himself as the Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander, General-in-chief of Left Guard (左衛大將軍), Commander Unequaled in Honor, Supreme Pillar of State, and King of the Silla State.<sup>20</sup> The Left Guard was one of the sixteen guard divisions (衛) of the Tang army. The basic unit of the Tang military system was the “defensive garrison” (折衝府) whose soldiers were deployed for both defensive and offensive operations. Each guard unit controlled between forty and sixty defensive garrison units. Tang regarded Silla forces

<sup>15</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 6: 74.

<sup>16</sup> Kurihara Masuo, “Ichi hachi seiki no higasi ajia sekai,” in *Zui Tō teikoku to higasi Ajia sekai*, ed. Tōdaishi Kenkyūkai (Tōkyō: Kyūko Shoin, 1979), 141.

<sup>17</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 6: 75.

<sup>18</sup> Kim Chongbok, “Paekche wa Koguryŏ koji e taehan Tang ū chibae yangsang,” in *Yŏksa wa hyŏsil* 78 (2010): 80.

<sup>19</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 6: 78.

<sup>20</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 7: 89.

as the defensive garrison installed in the subordinate prefecture of Kyerim, granting the title general-in-chief of Left Guard to King Munmu. The granting of the general-in-chief title used in the sixteen Tang guard divisions did not reflect the subordinate prefecture system any less strongly than in the granting of the subordinate prefecture title.<sup>21</sup>

Silla expressed its displeasure with Tang measures after the fall of Koguryŏ by supporting the anti-Tang resistance of Koguryŏ refugees while at the same time attacking the Ungjin Prefecture Command. In 672, Silla established Soburi prefecture (所夫里州) in the former capital of Paekche. Two years later in 674, Tang deprived King Munmu of his bestowed titles and declared his younger brother Kim Inmun 金仁問 King of the Silla State. With this Tang mounted an attack against its erstwhile ally, leading to the Silla-Tang War.<sup>22</sup> The last battle between Silla and Tang occurred in the eleventh month of 676<sup>23</sup> but as Tang was planning to attack Silla in the ninth month of 678,<sup>24</sup> the two combatants reached an uneasy truce. This cold relationship was reflected in the titles Tang continued to bestow on the Silla king. The reinstated title of King Munmu in 675, handed down to his successors, and the bestowed titles of King Simmun (神文王, r. 681-691), King Hyoso (孝昭王, r. 692-702), and King Sŏngdŏk (聖德王, r. 702-737) were Bulwark General-in-chief (輔國大將軍), Temporary General-in-chief of the Mighty Guard of the Left (行左豹韜衛大將軍), Kyerim Prefecture Commander (鷄林州都督), and King of Silla.<sup>25</sup> Compared to the titles bestowed on King Munmu in the seventh month of 671, the Commander Unequaled in Honor and Supreme Pillar of State titles were absent, and they were downgraded from Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander to Kyerim Prefecture Commander.

The bestowed titles of King Munmu, who was downgraded in 675, were in use until the enthronement of King Sŏngdŏk in 702. One might consider this evidence of Tang mistreatment of Silla but it bears remembering that Silla was not submissive to Tang. Over a three-decade period, Silla sent emissaries to Tang only four times. Moreover, when Tang emissaries demanded in 692 that the temple name T'aejong 太宗 of King Muyeŏl of Silla be changed because it was the same as Taizong 太宗 of Tang, Silla refused.<sup>26</sup>

The two states, however, endeavored to improve relations after the truce. In particular, the Tang Empress Wu Zetian 武則天 (r. 690-705) declared that the Tang

<sup>21</sup> Kim Chongbok, *Parhae chŏngch'ŏ ogyo sa*, 97.

<sup>22</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 7: 89-91.

<sup>23</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 7:92.

<sup>24</sup> Sima Guang, *Zizhi tongjian*, 202: 6385.

<sup>25</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 8: 98.

<sup>26</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 8: 98.

court would put an end to the war to win the hearts of the people and seek friendly ties with neighboring states.<sup>27</sup> First, in 694, Wu Zetian's Zhou court delivered the body of Kim Inmun, who died in Luoyang, to Silla, whereupon Silla immediately adopted the Zhou calendar (周曆),<sup>28</sup> implemented five years earlier in 690.<sup>29</sup> Silla later adopted the Xia calendar (夏曆) when Zhou instituted it in 700.<sup>30</sup> King Söngdök subsequently sent emissaries to Tang twice every year from his enthronement in 702 to the end of his reign in 737. Amidst this amicable mood, Tang upgraded King Söngdök in 707 from Bulwark General-in-chief (Rank 2A) to Cavalry General-in-chief (驃騎大將軍, Rank 1B).<sup>31</sup>

In the tenth month of 713, right after being enthroned, the Tang Emperor Xuanzong 玄宗 (r. 712–756) newly invested King Söngdök as Cavalry General-in-chief, Lord Specially Advanced (特進), Temporary General-in-chief of the Left Mighty Guard (行左威衛大將軍), Commissioned with Extraordinary Powers (使持節), Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander-Prefect (大都督鷄林州諸軍事雞林州刺史), Supreme Pillar of State, Duke of the Lelang Commandery, and King of Silla.<sup>32</sup> The civil prestige title Lord Specially Advanced and honorific rank of Supreme Pillar of State were added, thereby moving close to the level of the bestowed titles of King Munmu in 671. It is important to take note of the new titles Commissioned with Extraordinary Powers, Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander-Prefect as they did not previously. Commissioned with Extraordinary Powers denotes independent military authority while Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander-Prefect indicates a military area administered independently.<sup>33</sup>

Tang had previously established relations with Parhae in the second month of 713. Tang recognition of the independent military authority of Silla can be understood as an attempt to keep the neighboring Parhae in check. This motivation is evident in the 733 Tang call upon Silla to attack Parhae, accompanied by the imperial conferring of the titles Commander Unequaled in Honor and Marine Stability Military Commander (寧海軍使) to King Söngdök.<sup>34</sup> The promotion from Lord Specially Advanced to Commander Unequaled in Honor represents a restoration of the friendly terms of the Tang-Silla relationship of 671. Furthermore, the title Marine Stability Military Commander indicates the temporary Tang acceptance of Silla military activities to ensure the stability of East of the Sea (海東).

<sup>27</sup> Huang Yue-se, *Huang yuese sui-tang shi lunji*, (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1997), 66–67.

<sup>28</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 8: 98.

<sup>29</sup> Sima Guang, *Zizhi tongjian*, 204: 6426.

<sup>30</sup> Sima Guang *Zizhi tongjian*1, 207: 6553; Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 8: 99.

<sup>31</sup> Wang Pu, comp., *Tang huiyao*, (Shanghai: Shanghai Guji Chubanshe, 2012 [982]), 95: 2028.

<sup>32</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 8: 100.

<sup>33</sup> Kim Han'gyu, *Kodae tong Asea makpu ch'eche yon'gu* (Söul: Ilchogak, 1997), 320–321.

<sup>34</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 8: 104.

Taking advantage of the Tang expectation that Silla would keep Parhae in check, Silla expanded its territory to the northwest. The conditions of the Silla-Tang alliance allowed for Silla to take the area south of Taedong River (大同江) but the northwest frontier of Silla after the Silla-Tang war, remained at Imjin River (臨津江). In the twelfth month of 713, Silla crossed the Imjin and advanced to the Yesŏng River (禮成江), subsequently building a fortification at Kaesŏng 開城.<sup>35</sup> During its preparations for an assault on Parhae in 735, Silla announced that its troops would advance to the Taedong River and that Tang should cede control of the territory the following year.<sup>36</sup>

## (2) From Parhae Commandery Prince to King of the Parhae State

After Koguryŏ fell, Tang forcibly relocated Koguryŏ refugees to Tang territory three times: in 668, 669, and 681.<sup>37</sup> The refugees had to pass through Yingzhou 營州 (present-day Chaoyang 朝陽) on their way from Liaodong 遼東 into Tang. Yingzhou was the strategic hub from which Tang controlled the Khitan 契丹 residing in the western steppes of Liaoxi 遼西 so this area was inhabited not only by Khitan subdued by Tang but also by Koguryŏ refugees and Malgal tribes. In response to Tang officials' inability to aid the people who had suffered from poor crops, Songmo Prefecture Commander (松漠都督) Li Jinzhong 李盡忠 rebelled in 696 and conquered Yingzhou. For the following four years, the region was thrown into a state of confusion. Taking advantage of this opportunity, Tae Cho-yŏng led Koguryŏ refugees and Malgal tribes into Liaodong. Two year later, in 698, he fled to the east to avoid Tang subjugation and founded Chin'guk 振國 (C. Zhenguo) which later came to be known as Parhae. He immediately sent diplomatic emissaries to the Göktürks (突厥) and Silla.

Tang regarded Tae Cho-yŏng as a rebel but with the re-enthronement of Emperor Zhongzong 中宗 (r. 705–710), Tang began to change this policy. In 707, Zhongzong sent the emissary Zhang Xingji 張行岷 to appease Tae Cho-yŏng and grant him Tang titles.<sup>38</sup> The purpose of this mission was to disrupt Göktürk along with surrounding states.<sup>39</sup>

<sup>35</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 8: 100.

<sup>36</sup> Li Fang, et al., comp., *Wenyuan yinghua* (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1966 [1986]), 471: 2404; Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 8: 105.

<sup>37</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 6: 79; 22: 222.

<sup>38</sup> Liu Xu, *Jiu tangshu*, 199: 5360.

<sup>39</sup> Wei Guozhong, "Dazharong qianzi shitang shijian kao," *Beifang wenwu* 4 (1985): 56–59. Wei Guozhong discovered the reason from a phrase in the *Jiu tangshu*, "Upon the enthronement of Emperor Zhongzong, Qapaghan Qaghan (默噉) launched attacks on Mingsha prefecture in Lingzhou (靈州 鳴沙縣) again. . . . When Emperor Zhongzong requested his subjects to suggest the measures for defeating the Göktürks, Lu Fu 盧備 recommended to launch attacks the Göktürks along with the surrounding tribes." See Liu Xu, *Jiu tangshu*, 194: 5170. In comparison to the *Jiu tangshu* (7: 143) and the *Zizhi tongjian* (208:6607), it is not in



Tang managed to suppress the revolt of Li Jinzhong with the help of the Göktürks, but they later subdued the Khitan and the Xi (奚), and then pressured to demand a tribute to Tang. Moreover, the Khitans who had surrendered to the Göktürks still occupied Yingzhou. In order to defeat the Göktürks to the north, Tang had to strategically pursue alliances with its surrounding states. In particular, Tang had to improve its relationships with Chin'guk and Silla in the east in order to retake Yingzhou from the Khitan. Tang recognized the substantial presence of Tae Cho-yǒng, and upgraded King Sōngdök of Silla from Bulwark General-in-chief to Cavalry General-in-chief.

After sending the envoy Zhang Xingji, the Tang court intended to grant Tae Cho-yǒng Tang official titles. However, as the Göktürks and Khitans invaded Tang, so Tang delayed the investitures until the second month of 713 when it granted Tae Cho-yǒng the titles general-in-chief of the Left Courageous Guard (左驍衛大將軍),<sup>40</sup> Holhan Prefecture Commander (忽汗州都督), and Parhae Commandery Prince (渤海郡王). The general-in-chief of the Left Courageous Guard, as was the case with Silla, is a general of Tang's central army sixteen Guard divisions. Holhan Prefecture Commander is an official title of a Tang subordinate prefecture, established nominally in Chin'guk territory.

The bestowed titles to Silla included not only Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander, but also King of Silla, used by Silla itself. The bestowed titles on Tae Cho-yǒng, however, did not include King of Chin'guk, thereby suggesting that Tang intentionally did not recognize Chin'guk as an independent state. Instead, the Tang court granted the noble title Parhae Commandery Prince, confirming the Tang intention to suggest that Tae Cho-yǒng was a county leader rather than a state leader, even though Parhae was located beyond the Gulf of Pohai and beyond Tang territory. In order to distinguish Parhae from the other Malgal tribes, Parhae became Parhae Malgal by borrowing the name from the title Parhae Commandery Prince. After 741, it was simply called Parhae.<sup>41</sup>

---

the second month 705, the time of enthronement of Emperor Zhongzong, that the Göktürks launched an attack on Lingzhou, but instead, it was in the twelfth month 706. It was in the first month 707 that Lu Fu recommended launching attacks in alliance with the surrounding tribes.

<sup>40</sup> The *Jiu tangshu* (199: 5360) and the *Cefu yuangui* (964: 11342) indicate Supernumerary General-in-chief of Left Courageous Guard (左驍衛員外大將軍). A third source, the *Xintangshu*, indicates General-in-chief of Left Courageous Guard. Supernumerary (員外) means a member outside the authentic members specified under the system. All records indicate General-in-chief of Left Courageous Guard for King Mun and King Mu. Tae Choyǒng was probably promoted from Supernumerary General-in-chief of Left Courageous Guard to General-in-chief of Left Courageous Guard at a certain time, or Supernumerary was omitted because when an office was granted to a foreigner, it would be meaningless to distinguish an authentic member from a member outside the system. What we want to indicate here, however, is that the *Xin tangshu* did not record the raw historical materials as they were. See Ouyang Xiu, et al., comp., *Xin tangshu* (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1975 [1060]), 219: 6180.

<sup>41</sup> As Tae Choyǒng was installed as Parhae Commandery Prince, *Jiu tangshu* says: "From that time on,

After installing Tae Cho-yŏng in office, Tang granted new titles to King Sŏngdŏk of Silla. These included the titles Commissioned with Extraordinary Powers, Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander-Prefect, which all denote independent military authority, as Tang had every intention to keep Parhae in check. Tang thereby established diplomatic ties with Parhae to keep the Khitan in check, but it was also concerned that Parhae, which had already established friendly relations with the Göktürks, would not adhere to Tang intentions. After forging diplomatic ties with Parhae, Tang took advantage of the weakened Göktürks to subdue the Khitan during the late rule of Qapaghan Qaghan (默啜可汗, r. ?-716). In 717, Tang recovered Yingzhou. When the Göktürks restored their power, however, the situation had to change. With the enthronement of King Mu (武王, r. 718-737), Parhae began to go its own way, diverging from the Tang agenda.

The bestowed titles general-in-chief of the Left Courageous Guard, Holhan Prefecture Commander, and Parhae Commandery Prince, equally applied to King Mu in 719. However, as King Mu maintained an independent attitude, so he internally offered the posthumous title King Ko (高王) to Tae Choyŏng, and used the era name Inan (仁安). In the ninth month of 720, Tang sent Zhang Yue 張越 to Parhae, to announce the betrayal of Khitan and Xi in violation of Tang's interests, and proposed to subjugate them jointly.<sup>42</sup> This is because Bilge Qaghan 毘伽加汗 (r. 716–734) of the Göktürks had restored his power, leading Khitan to surrender to him again. But King Mu disagreed with the proposal and moved to control the surrounding Malgal tribes himself.

As a result, the Hüksu 黑水 (C. Heishui) Malgal and Tang forged close ties in 726. This prompted Parhae to become divided over the subjugation of the Hüksu Malgal. Tae Munye 大門藝, the younger brother of King Mu, fled to Tang, thus heightening diplomatic conflicts between Parhae and Tang over his extradition. Finally, Parhae forged alliances with the Göktürks and Khitan,<sup>43</sup> and then in 732 Parhae launched attacks on Dengzhou (登州) in Tang. Eventually, Parhae resumed diplomatic ties with Tang in 734. From 731 to 735, Emperor Xuanzong sent four imperial letters to King Mu.<sup>44</sup> The

---

Parhae offered tribute to Tang every year" (*Jiu tangshu* 199: 5360). In this respect, *Xin tangshu* changed the phrasing: "From that time on, the name of Malgal was abandoned and only the name of Parhae was used." (*Xin tangshu* 219: 6180) By referring to these records, Chinese academics such as Wei Guozhong believe that the early name of the state, which was founded by Tae Choyŏng, was not Chin'guk, but rather Malgal, and that after 713, the state name changed to Parhae. See Wei Guozhong, "Bohai guohao chucheng 'mohe' zaikao," *Gaoguli yanjiu* (2006), 103. This, however, is an erroneous reading of the historical records. The subject of this phrase is not Tae Choyŏng but Tang. The *Jiu tangshu* and *Cefu yuangui*, among other, confirm that Tang called Chin'guk by diverse names, such as Malgal, Eastern Frontier Malgal (東蕃靺鞨), Parhae Malgal, and Parhae. Parhae came to be used exclusively after 741.

<sup>42</sup> Wang Qinruo, *Cefu yuangui*, 986: 11584.

<sup>43</sup> Li Fang, *Wenyuan yinghua*, 647: 3331.

<sup>44</sup> Li Fang, *Wenyuan yinghua*, 471: 2405–2406. For details, see Kim Chongbok, "Parhae wa tang ūi sasin

titles of King Mu at the head of these letters were Holhan Prefecture Commander and Holhan Prefect (忽汗州刺史). Both titles were used interchangeably. When relations soured with Parhae, Tang temporarily downgraded King Mu from Holhan Prefecture Commander to Holhan Prefect. When the relationships improved, however, Tang upgraded King Mu from Holhan Prefect to Holhan Prefecture Commander.

King Mun (文王, r. 737-793), enthroned in 737, also received the Tang titles general-in-chief of the Left Courageous Guard, Holhan Prefecture Commander, and Parhae Commandery Prince. He moved to positively improve the ties with Tang and later built the Parhae political system on the Tang model. In 741, Tang cut ties with the Malgal tribes Buryöl 拂涅, Worhüi 越喜, and Chöllli 鐵利. Tang had initially used the names Malgal, Eastern Frontier Malgal (東蕃靺鞨), Parhae Malgal, and Parhae, interchangeably but when it finally subsumed all these names into “Parhae,” it implied that Tang acknowledged Parhae's supremacy over the surrounding Malgal tribes.

This prompted Tang to give King Mun several office promotions. According to the *Jintangshu* “Account of Parhae Malgal,” during the Tianbao 天寶 period (742–756), Tang granted him the titles Lord Specially Advanced (特進) and Advisor to the Heir Apparent (太子詹事賓客). In 762, Tang upgraded him from Parhae Commandery Prince (渤海郡王, Rank 1B) to King of the Parhae State (渤海國王, Rank 1A), and during the Dali 大曆 period (766–779), Tang granted him the title Minister of Works (司空) and Defender-in-chief (太尉). His promotion to King of the Parhae State suggests that Tang officially approved the raising the status of the Parhae state in return for not intervening in the rebellion of An Lushan 安祿山.<sup>45</sup>

Unlike the military title general-in-chief of the Left Courageous Guard granted King Mun upon his enthronement, these were civilian titles. Among these, Lord Specially Advanced was one grade lower than Commander Unequal in Honor granted to King Söngdök of Silla. King Mun, however, was made Defender-in-chief ahead of King Söndök (宣德王, r. 780-785) of Silla. After the mid-eighth century, Tang bestowed titles changed from military titles to civil titles. Why did they change? Why did Tang give diplomatic priority to Silla over Parhae as reflected in the titles bestowed to each state?

## 2. Tang Bestowed Titles to Silla and Parhae in the Late-Eighth and Ninth Centuries

p'akyön ül t'onghae pon Taemunye mangmyöng sakön üi ch'ui,” *Yöksa wa kyönggye* 76 (2010): 1–27.

<sup>45</sup> Kim Chongbok, *Parhae chöngch'i oegyö sa*, 146–147.

### (1) Sustainability of Tang Titles Bestowed to Silla

The Silla-Tang relationship was eventually restored in full; when King Hyosǒng (孝成王, r. 737-742) died and King Kyǒngdök (景德王, r. 742-765) was enthroned in 743, their Tang titles were Commander Unequaled in Honor, Commissioned with Extraordinary Powers, Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander, Commissioned with Special Powers, Marine Stability Military Commander, and King of Silla.<sup>46</sup> However, they should have included Kyerim Prefect and Supreme Pillar of State, which were deleted by mistake. The titles bestowed on King Sǒndök, who was enthroned in 785, included the above titles and the new title of acting defender-in-chief (檢校太尉). These bestowed titles were handed down to King Hǒn'gang (憲康王, r. 875-886) in the second half of the ninth century.

Military titles, such as cavalry general-in-chief and temporary general-in-chief of the Left Mighty Guard were notably absent from the titles bestowed in 743. This deletion was not attributable to the accidental deletion of data, but rather to a change in the Tang system. At some time during or near the reign of Emperor Xuanzong, the farmer-soldier system collapsed, thereby leading to the career soldier called the Imperial body-guard (羽林軍), being more valued than the Sixteen Guard Divisions. Furthermore, the collapse of the bureaucratic system after the rebellion of An Lushan, based on code and statute, caused the emergence of temporary offices, such as surveillance commissioner (觀察使), revenue commissioner (度支使), and military commissioner (節度使). These played important roles in all areas, including local administration, finance, and military. The weakness of the Sixteen Guards resulted in the elimination of the title general-in-chief of Sixteen Guards from the titles bestowed upon the monarchs of neighboring states. In the case of Silla, the Tang court replaced it with Marine Stability Military Commander (寧海軍使) in 733.<sup>47</sup>

Among these changes acting defender-in-chief title was added in 785. 'Acting' (檢校) was a term attached to a temporary office before one was officially appointed to office. As various commissioners emerged after the Emperor Xuanzong period, the meaning of the title 'acting' began to change. The military officers under a surveillance commissioner or military commissioner did not officially receive an office from the court. Therefore, in order to show the authority of their position, the commissioners attached 'acting' to their titles to call themselves high-ranking officers.

An acting defender-in-chief was a Rank 1A honorary officer, which was commonly known as one of the so-called Three Dukes (三公), together with the Minister of

---

<sup>46</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 9: 107.

<sup>47</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 8: 104.

Instruction (司徒) and Minister of Works (司空). Tang already granted the kings of Silla high-level titles, so the granting of the acting defender-in-chief title befitted the kings of Silla. It is unclear, however, why the Tang court should have done so in 785. The Tang titles bestowed upon the kings of Silla changed in parallel with Tang foreign policy in 707, 713, and 734, so in the year 785 as well there was a change in Tang diplomacy that precipitated the change. This cannot be proven directly through available documentary evidence but considering the situation at that time, there are two possibilities.

First, as in the cases of 713 and 734, the change may have been part of Tang measures to keep Parhae in check. After the abolishment of Andong Protectorate (安東都護府) in 758, Tang probably requested Silla to restrain Parhae from advancing into Liaodong. Parhae emissaries sent to Japan in 758 and 759 held the titles of Temporary Mokchō Prefect (行木底州刺史) and Hyōndo Prefect (玄菟州刺史), respectively.<sup>48</sup> Mokchō prefecture, which belongs to Andong Protectorate, is currently Xinbin of Liaoning Province. Hyōndo prefecture indicates Hyōndo-sōng 玄菟城, which was constructed by Koguryō in the so-called Third Xuantu Commandery (玄菟郡), and is located currently in Fushun. These facts seem to suggest that Parhae had advanced to Liaodong. However in the ninth-century the Parhae local administrative system of five capitals (京), fifteen Prefectures (府), and sixty-two prefectures (州), nothing matches Liaodong. Thus, it is obvious that Parhae temporarily advanced to Liaodong and later abandoned it in order to advance to the northeast.<sup>49</sup> Meanwhile, King Sōndōk of Silla stabilized the area south of the P'ae River (溟江, present-day Taedong River) in 781, and personally travelled to Hansan prefecture (漢山州) and relocated residents to P'aegang fortress (溟江鎮) in the subsequent year in a bid to actively administer the northern region.<sup>50</sup> This Silla policy probably restrained Parhae from advancing to Liaodong.

Second, it is possible that the independent military commissioners active in present northern China after the Rebellion of An Lushan, rose up against the control of the Tang court in 781-787, causing Tang to seek support from Silla in the seventh month of 819. Tang asked Silla for military aid and Silla sent 30,000 troops in order to subdue the military commissioner of Pinglu (平盧節度使) Li Shidao 李師道.<sup>51</sup> The military commissioner of Pinglu controlled Silla and Parhae externally. Considering the relations between Silla and the military commissioner of Pinglu, Tang presumably asked for military aid to Silla so as to subdue an independent military commissioner in 783.

The titles granted to the kings of Silla after 785 and throughout the ninth century

<sup>48</sup> Sugano Mamichi, comp., *Shoku Nihongi* (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1998 [797]), 21:291; 22:331.

<sup>49</sup> Tsuda Sōkichi. *Tsuda Sōkichi zenshu* 12 (Tōkyō: Iwanami Shoten), 1964, 98.

<sup>50</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 9:113

<sup>51</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 10:121.

included Commander Unequaled in Honor, acting defender-in-chief, Commissioned with Extraordinary Powers, Kyerim Superior Prefecture Commander-Prefect, Commissioned with Special Powers, Marine Stability Military Commander, Supreme Pillar of State, and King of Silla. In all categories, Tang consistently granted the highest titles, suggesting not only that the court offered special treatment to Silla, but also that the relationship continued steadily over time. This is in contrast to the Parhae case to which we shall turn later. Such special treatment is well illustrated by Emperor Xuanzong's 731 imperial letter to King Söngdök in which he wrote to the effect that since Silla was a state in the spirit of the Great Gentleman (君子) and fidelity, he would treat Silla like the other neighboring states.<sup>52</sup> When King Söngdök died in 738, Emperor Xuanzong identified Silla as a state of the Great Gentleman to the condolence envoy.<sup>53</sup> There is another case of Tang recognition of Silla as a state of the Great Gentleman was confirmed in Dali period (766–779)<sup>54</sup>. The Great Gentleman is the highest prestige calling granted to a man of virtue and one of the most important virtues is the trust between the monarch and his subjects. For this reason, Tang acknowledged that Silla faithfully performed its duty as a subject.

Therefore, in 897 when the Parhae envoy requested to be seated at a higher place than the Silla envoy in Tang's Court, Tang naturally rejected the request. Ch'oe Ch'iwön 崔致遠 said, "Tang does not determine the order of the state name, that is, the seating order, according to the power of each state. How can one change the ranking, determined by the Tang Court, on the basis of state strength or weakness? The order should follow conventional."<sup>55</sup> Here, the class determined by Tang Court indicates the class of bestowed titles. Since the title bestowed on the king of Silla was higher than that of the king of Parhae, Tang rejected the request of the Parhae envoy. Silla cited the following two reasons for Silla having a higher status than Parhae. One was that Tae Choyöng received the title of Taeach'an 大阿湊 from Silla right after founding Chin'guk, and the other was that Silla officially received highest office of Qin (秦官極品), while Parhae only temporarily received the title Zhou Minister of War (周禮夏卿). The highest office of Qin is obviously Defender-in-chief while Minister of War of Zhou presumably indicates the title General-in-chief of Left Courageous Guard granted to the kings of Parhae in the first half of the eight century.<sup>56</sup> Since Tang expected Silla to keep Parhae

<sup>52</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 8:103.

<sup>53</sup> Liu Xu, *Jiu tangshu*, 199: 5337; Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 9: 106.

<sup>54</sup> Ch'oe Ch'iwön quoted the Tang imperial letter sent during the Dali period, which identified Silla as a state of the Great Gentleman. See Sö Kōjōng comp., *Tongmunsōn* (Söul: Kyōnghŭi Ch'ulp'ansa, 1966–1967 [1478]), 33: 428.

<sup>55</sup> Sö Kōjōng, *Tongmunsōn*, 33: 429.

<sup>56</sup> The highest office of Qin is a figurative expression suggesting that Defender-in-chief is the highest officer in the ancient Qin system. Zhou Minister of War is a military minister in the ancient Zhou

in check and Silla responded positively to that expectation, Tang recognized Silla as a state of the Great Gentleman. On the other hand, in 733 when Tang asked the attack against Parhae to Silla, Tang chided Parhae with saying that “it [Parhae] outwardly calls itself a subject while inwardly harboring slyness.”<sup>57</sup>

## (2) The Fluctuation of Tang Titles Bestowed to Parhae

When King Mun ascended the throne, Tang installed him as Parhae Commandery Prince. The court upgraded him to King of the Parhae State in 762, even granting him the title of Acting Defender-in-chief (檢校太尉). After he died in 793, his successor, the indirect descendant Tae Wōnūi 大元義 (r. 783–794) was murdered in less than a year, resulting in the enthronement of King Sōng (成王, r. 794–794), King Mun’s grandson. He died soon after as well and King Kang (康王, r. 794–808), another grandson of King Mun, succeeded him as king. King Kang ruled for fourteen years but within the ten years after his death, his sons King Chōng (定王, r. 809–813), King Hūi (僖王, r. 813–817), and King Kan 簡王 (r. 817–818) ruled in succession until 818 when King Sōn 宣王, (r. 818–830), a descendant of Tae Yabal 大野勃, a younger brother of Tae Choyōng, ascended the throne.<sup>58</sup> This ended the conflicts over royal succession. At this time, the northern Malgal tribes, including Wōrhūi 越喜, Uru 虞婁, and Hūksu 黑水, escaped the control of the Parhae court and independently forged diplomatic ties with Tang in 802 and 815.<sup>59</sup>

Tang did not install Tae Wōnūi or King Sōng until 795 when King Kang was enthroned, and it downgraded King Kang again to Parhae Commandery Prince, General-in-chief of Left Courageous Guard and Holhan Prefecture Commander. King Kang demanded that Tang reverse the demotion. In 798, Tang granted him the title Grand Master of the Palace with the titles Silver Seal and Blue Ribbon (銀青光錄大夫), Acting Minister of Works (檢校司空), King of the Parhae State, and Holhan Prefecture Commander. In 805, Tang further granted him the titles Grand Master of the Palace with Golden Seal and Purple Ribbon (金紫光祿大夫) and Acting Minister of Instruction (檢校司徒)<sup>60</sup> and, in 806, promoted him to Acting Defender-in-chief. The

---

system. As mentioned later, the Silla Acting Defender-in-chief is the Parhae Acting Director of the Palace Library. The Director of the Palace Library corresponds to the Minister of Rites (春卿). The Minister of War may thus have been written in error instead of the Minister of Rites. The Minister of War, which was responsible for military affairs, is probably the General-in-chief of Left Courageous Guard.

<sup>57</sup> Kim Pusik, *Samguk sagi*, 43: 419.

<sup>58</sup> Ouyang Xiu, *Xin tangshu*, 219: 6181.

<sup>59</sup> Wang Qinruo, *Cefu yuangui*, 972: 11417, 11418.

<sup>60</sup> According to the *Jiu tangshu* (199: 5362), King Kang received the titles Grand Master of the Palace with

court further promoted him from Grand Master of the Palace with Silver Seal and Blue Ribbon (Rank 3B) to Grand Master of the Palace with Golden Seal and Purple Ribbon (Rank 3A) in Civil Prestige Title. In the case of acting officers, promotion followed the order of Minister of Works, Minister of Instruction, and Defender-in-chief, suggesting that although these titles were collectively Three Dukes (三公) of Rank 1A, they were differentiated hierarchically.

The Tang court demoted the king in 795 presumably because it was aware of the power struggles in Parhae court. Until the mid-eighth century, the Khitan and Xi were internally divided between the pro-Tang and pro-Göktürk factions.<sup>61</sup> Parhae attacked Dengzhou in 732, with the help of the Göktürks and Khitan. Tang presumably suspected that, after the pro-Tang King Mun died, his successor King Kang would continue to implement pro-Tang policies.

King Kang, for his part, probably demanded the titles granted to King Mun as a means of strengthening his kingship against opposition forces. In 798, Tang promoted King Kang to a higher office, suggesting that he had eliminated Tang suspicions and stabilized his kingship. The titles bestowed upon him, however, were still lower than Lord Specially Advanced, Minister of Works, and Defender-in-chief, all which King Mun held during the latter part of his rule. King Kang therefore continued to demand higher ranking titles and presumably attained promotion to Grand Master of the Palace with Golden Seal and Purple Ribbon and Acting Defender-in-chief in 805 and 806, respectively. After King Kang, King Chōng in 809, on King Hūi in 813, and on King Sōn in 818 all received the titles Grand Master of the Palace with Silver Seal and Blue Ribbon, Acting Director of the Palace Library (秘書監), Holhan Prefecture Commander, and King of the Parhae State.<sup>62</sup>

The Tang court downgraded the titles from Grand Master of the Palace with Golden Seal and Purple Ribbon and Acting Defender-in-chief, previously granted to King Kang, to Grand Master of the Palace with Silver Seal and Blue Ribbon and Acting Director of Palace Library. Compared to Grand Master of the Palace with Silver Seal and Blue Ribbon, Acting Minister of Works, granted to King Kang in 798, the Civil Prestige

---

Silver Seal and Blue Ribbon and Acting Minister of Works in 798, and Grand Master of the Palace with Golden Seal and Purple Ribbon and Acting Minister of Works again in 805. It seems that he became Acting Minister of Works twice. According to *Jiu tangshu* (14: 407–408), he was upgraded from Acting Minister of Works to Acting Minister of Instruction in 805, while the *Cefu yuangui* (965: 11352–11353) indicates that he was upgraded to Grand Master of the Palace with Golden Seal and Purple Ribbon and Acting Minister of Instruction in 805. Accepting the latter records as accurate, “Acting Minister of Works,” granted in 805 in the former records, is a clerical error and should have been “Acting Minister of Instruction.”

<sup>61</sup> Denis Twitchett, “Hsüan-tsung (r. 712–56),” in *The Cambridge History of China, Volume 3: Sui and T'ang China, 509–906, Part I*, ed. Dennis Twitchett (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979), 438–440.

<sup>62</sup> Liu Xu, *Jiu tangshu*, 199: 5362, 5363.



Title was the same but the “acting” title was downgraded from Minister of Works (Rank 1A) to Director of the Palace Library (Rank 3B). This demotion was presumably in consideration of the fact that the king of Parhae did not meet his expected role as a subject, and that the power struggles of Parhae continued from the death of King Mun to the enthronement of King Sŏn.

Tang promoted King Sŏn in 820 to Grand Master of the Palace with Golden Seal and Purple Ribbon and to Acting Minister of Works. He subjugated several tribes alongside the North of the Sea (海北) and expanded his territory to northeastern Parhae. Tang rewarded him with promotion to Acting Minister of Works for this great feat.<sup>63</sup> These tribes were the northern Malgal that Parhae independently controlled through an agreement negotiated with Tang during internal power struggles of Parhae. King Sŏn subjugated these tribes and established Hoewŏn Prefecture (懷遠府) and Anwŏn Prefecture (安遠府) among the Worhŭi.<sup>64</sup>

After his succeeding King Sŏn, it is unclear what titles Tae Ijin 大彝震 (r. 830–858) received from the Tang court after his enthronement in 830. Upon his enthronement in 858, Tae Kŏnhwang 大虔晃 (r. 858–870) received the titles Grand Master of the Palace with Silver Seal and Blue Ribbon, Acting Director of Palace Library, Holhan Prefecture Commander, and King of the Parhae State. The titles were downgraded from Grand Master of the Palace with Golden Seal and Purple Ribbon and Acting Minister of Works. *Jitangshu* and *Xintangshu* only mention the next king Tae Hyŏnsŏk 大玄錫 (r. 870–895 or earlier) without reference to his titles.

*Tanghuiyao* 唐會要 contains an interesting entry. The Institute of Academicians (翰林院), which was responsible for writing the tenth month of 895 imperial letter to be sent to Tae Wihae 大瑋瑋, the 14th king of Parhae, transferred its duties to the Secretariat (中書省) because the content of the letter was related to the promotion of office.<sup>65</sup> In previous times, this article has been misread to mean that, with the enthronement of Tae Wihae, his installation was delivered.<sup>66</sup> Careful attention to the imperial letter reveals, however, that Tae Wihae, like his predecessors, received the Tang titles Grand Master of the Palace with Silver Seal and Blue Ribbon, Acting Director of Palace Library, Holhan Prefecture Commander, and King of the Parhae State before 895. In the tenth month of 895, he was upgraded to Grand Master of the Palace with Golden Seal and Purple Ribbon and Acting Minister of Works.<sup>67</sup> The reason for this promotion is unclear.

In 795–926, the latter half of Parhae, eleven kings were enthroned. Out of

<sup>63</sup> Liu Xu, *Xin tangshu*, 219: 6181.

<sup>64</sup> Song Kiho, *Parhae chŏngch'i sa yŏn'gu* (Sŏul: Ilchokak, 1995), 148.

<sup>65</sup> Wang Pu, *Tang huiyao*, 57: 1153.

<sup>66</sup> Jin Yufu, *Bobai guozhi changbian* (Liaoyang: Qianhua Shangguan), 19: 18b–19a.

<sup>67</sup> Kim Chongbok, *Parhae chŏngch'i oekyo sa*, 212.

eleven kings, nine kings were installed, while of nine kings installed, three kings were additionally promoted later. Although the promotion rate is not low, there were probably reasons for Tang to offer promotions as they did in 820. King Chǒng (定王, r. 809-813), King Hǔi (僖王, r. 813-817), and King Kan (簡王, r. 817-818) were enthroned at short intervals during the internal Parhae power struggles, suggesting a low possibility of promotion. Except for these kings, the promoted ones are 3 out of 6, which seems to be high rate. With regard to the long-reigning Tae Ijin (r. 830–858) and Tae Kǒnhwang (r. 858–870), *Jitangshu* only mentioned the fact of their bestowal of Tang. With regard to Tae Hyōnsǒk (r. 870–895 or earlier), *Xintangshu* only mentioned his name. Despite the scanty Tang records, they were highly likely to have had additional upgraded titles. If this presumption is allowed, additional promotions were not special incidents but rather a routine practice. Thus Tang intentionally repeated the installation, promotion, and demotion of Parhae rulers. If the demotion of bestowed titles meant a reprimand for Parhae, then promotion would imply the appeasement of Parhae following such a reprimand. This offers a counter-proof that, unlike Silla, Parhae was not necessarily pro-Tang, as suggested by the fact that Parhae used its own era name despite being an invested state of Tang.

### 3. Conclusion

The emperors of China enacted the lord-subject relationship through granting office titles to the monarchs of neighboring states, including Silla and Parhae from the eighth to the tenth centuries. Tang nominally established the subordinate Kyerim prefecture (鷄林州) and Holhan prefecture (忽汗州) in these states respectively, thereby asserting the Tang order more strongly. The subordinate prefecture system, which was originally designed to separate and rule the northern nomads, transformed into state with subordinate prefectures: Silla and Parhae. For all intents and purposes, it developed into a practice of investiture. It appears, therefore, that this unilaterally created Tang order reflected a reality, as shown by the titles the Tang emperors bestowed upon the kings of Silla and Parhae. Tang's bestowed titles reflected its intended world order and its policy for implementing that order. If the Tang court could not realize its intentions, however, it had to change the bestowed titles. Silla and Parhae reluctantly accepted unequal relationships because they wanted to establish diplomatic ties with Tang but even with such diplomatic ties, these relationships could become more amicable or could devolve into conflict; the promotion of bestowed titles reflected diplomatic improvements while demotion followed on the heels of deterioration in the relationship.

Tang continued to promote the bestowed titles of Silla kings until the fall of Koguryō. After the Silla-Tang war, however, Tang downgraded Silla bestowed titles. In addition, Tang regarded Chin'guk — a state founded by Tae Choyōng with Koguryō refugees and Malgal tribes — as a rebel force. In order to hold the Göktürks and their subordinate Khitan and Xi polities in check, Tang had to improve relationships with Silla and Chin'guk. Tang bestowed Tae Choyōng as Parhae Commandery Prince (渤海郡王) to establish diplomatic ties with Parhae, but Parhae established relationships with the Göktürk. Tang therefore asked Silla to hold Parhae in check. As a result, Tang titles bestowed to Silla and Parhae were typically in contrast to one another. Tang constantly granted to Silla kings the highest ranking titles and ranks. This shows that the Silla-Tang relationship was stable for the long term. Meanwhile, Tang granted Parhae kings were lower offices with repeated cycles of promotion and demotion during the ninth century. From the Tang viewpoint, Silla was pro-Tang while Parhae was not.

Silla had two reasons to maintain a pro-Tang diplomacy. First, the emergence of Parhae became a threat to Silla and second, Silla intended to expand its northwestern border from Imjin River to the Taedong River. The bestowed titles granted to keep Parhae in check offered an opportunity for Silla to advance to Taedong River, of which it actively took advantage. On the other hand, Parhae established diplomatic ties with Tang and expanded its territory contrary to the Tang expectation that Parhae would keep the Khitan and Xi in check. Tang upgraded King Mun from Parhae Commandery Prince to King of the Parhae State (渤海國王) because he pursued pro-Tang policies but the kings after him appear not to have done so. Thus, Tang used the carrot and stick approach for Parhae through bestowed titles as Parhae and Tang were in a potentially confrontational relationship even though Parhae was a state invested by the Tang court.

## References

### Primary Sources

- Iryŏn, comp. *Yŏkchu samguk yusa* 譯註 三國遺事 [Memorabilia of the three kingdoms, translated and annotated]. Translated by Kang In'gu, et al. Sŏul: Iho Munhwasa, 2002–2003 [1281].
- Kim Pusik, comp. *Yŏkchu Samguk sagi* 譯註 三國史記 [History of the three kingdoms, translated and annotated]. Translated by Kim Kubok. Sŏngnam: Han'guk Chŏngsin Munhwa Yŏn'guwŏn, 1996 [1145].
- Li Fang, et al., comp. *Wenyuan yinghua* 文苑英華 [Finest flowers from the world of letters]. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1966 [986].
- Liu Xu, comp. *Jiu tangshu* 舊唐書 [Old Tang history]. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1975 [945].
- Ouyang Xiu, et al., comp. *Xin tangshu* 新唐書 [New Tang history]. [1060] Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1975 [1060].
- Sima Guang, et al. *Zizhi tongjian* 資治通鑑 [General mirror for the aid of government]. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1956 [1084].
- Sŏ Kŏjŏng, comp. *Tongmunŏn* 東文選 [Anthology of Korean literature]. Sŏul: Kyŏnghŭi Ch'ulp'ansa, 1966 [1478].
- Sugano Mamichi, comp. *Shokun Nibongi* 續日本紀 [Expanded chronicle of Japan]. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1998 [797].
- Wang Pu, comp. *Tang huiyao* 唐會要 [Institutional history of Tang]. Shanghai: Shanghai Guji Chubanshe, 2012 [982].
- Wang Qinruo, et al., comp. *Cefu yuangui* 冊府元龜 [Magical mirror in the palace library]. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1960 [1013].

### Secondary Sources

- Fairbank, John King, ed. *The Chinese World Order*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1968.
- Huang Yuese. *Huang yuese Sui-Tang shi lunji* 黃約瑟隋唐史論集 [Huang Yuese's collection of the history of Sui and Tang]. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1997.
- Hucker, Charles O. *A Dictionary of Official Titles in Imperial China*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1985.
- Jin Yufu. *Bobai guozhi changbian* 渤海國志長編 [Manuscript of Parhae history]. Liaoyang: Qianhua Shangan, 1934.

- Kaneko Shūichi. *Zui Tō no kokusai to higasi Ajia* 隋唐の国際秩序と東アジア [Sui and Tang international order and East Asia]. Tōkyō: Meicho Kankōkai, 2001.
- Kim Han'gyu. *Kodae tong Asea makpu ch'ebe yōn'gu* 古代東亞細亞幕府體制研究 [A Study on the ancient mu-fu system of East Asia]. Sōul: Ilchokak, 1997.
- Kim Hodong. “Tang ū kimi chibae wa pukpang yumok minjok ūi taeūng” 唐의 羈縻支配와 北方 遊牧民族의 對應 [The loose rein policy of the Tang dynasty and the response of the nomadic peoples]. *Yōksa hakpo* 歷史學報 137 (1993): 131–178.
- Kim Chongbok (Kim, Jongbok). *Parhae chōngch'i oegyo sa* 발해정치외교사 [The political and diplomatic history of Parhae]. Sōul: Ilchusa, 2009.
- Kim Chongbok (Kim, Jongbok). “Paekche wa koguryō kochi e taehan tang ūi chipae yangsang” 백제와 고구려 고지에 대한 당의 지배양상 [Tang's ruling of the old territories of Paekche and Koguryō]. *Yōksa wa hyōnsil* 역사와 현실 78 (2010): 73–103.
- Kim Chongbok (Kim, Jongbok). “Parhae wa Tang ūi sasin p'agyōn ūl t'onghae pon Tae Munye mangmyōng sakōn ūi ch'ui” 발해와 당의 사신 파견을 통해 본 大門藝 亡命 사건의 추이 [A study on development of Tae Munye's exile to Tang]. *Yōksa wa kyōnggye* 역사와 경제 76 (2010): 1–27.
- Kurihara Masuo. “Ichi hachi seiki no higasi Ajia sekai” 七・八世紀の 東アジア世界 [The East Asian world in the seventh and eighth centuries]. In *Zui Tō teikoku to higasi ajia sekai* 隋唐帝国と東アジア世界 [The Sui and Tang empires and The East Asian world]. Edited by Tōdaishi Kenkyūkai. Tōkyō: Kyūko Shoin, 1979.
- Nishijima Sadao. *Chūgoku kodai kokka to higasi Ajia sekai* 中國古代國家と東アジア世界 [The Chinese ancient state and the East Asian world]. Tōkyō: Tōkyō Daigaku Shūppankai, 1983.
- Song Kiho. *Parhae chōngch'i sa yōn'gu* 渤海政治史研究 [Research in development process of Parhae history and phase of country]. Sōul: Ilchokak, 1995.
- Song Kiho. *The Clash of Histories in East Asia*. Seoul: Northeast Asian History Foundation, 2010.
- Tōdaishi Kenkyūkai, ed. *Zui Tō teikoku to higasi Ajia sekai* 隋唐帝国と東アジア世界 [The Sui and Tang empires and the East Asian world]. Tōkyō: Kyūko Shoin, 1979.
- Tsuda Sōkichi. *Tsuda Sōkichi zenshu* 津田左右吉全集 [The complete works of Tsuda Sōkichi] 12. Tōkyō: Iwanami Shoten, 1964. Twitchett, Denis, ed. *The Cambridge History of China, Volume 3, Sui and Tang China, 509–906, Part I*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.
- Wei Guozhong. “Da Zharong qianzi shitang shijian kao” 大祚榮 ‘遣子’ 侍唐時間考 [A study on the time Tae Choyōng sent his son to the Tang Court]. *Beifang wenwu* 北方文物 4 (1985): 56–59.
- Wei Guozhong. “Bohai guohao chucheng ‘mohe’ zaikao” 渤海國號初稱 ‘靺鞨’ 再考 [A

Reconsideration of “Malgal” as the early name of Parhae]. *Gaogonli yanjiu* 高句麗研究 24 (2006): 103–113.

Yŏ Hogyu, et al. *Han'guk kodaek kukeka wa Chungguk wangjo ūi chogong ch'aekpong kwanye* 한국 고대 국가와 중국 왕조의 조공·책봉관계 [A study of tributary relationships between ancient states of Korean and Chinese dynasties]. Sŏul: Koguryŏ Yŏn'gu Chaedan, 2008.